

United Nations Environment Programme

UNEP

Division of Technology, Industry and Economics

Economics and Trade Branch

**Studies of EIA Practice
in Developing Countries**

Edited by Mary McCabe and Barry Sadler

A supplement to the UNEP EIA Training Resource Manual

EDITORIAL NOTE

These case studies have been arranged and formatted to accord with the template produced for the 1994-96 International Study of the Effectiveness of Environmental Assessment. They have been edited to conform to standard English usage. For the sake of consistent presentation some rewriting and reformatting has been necessary. The editors accept total responsibility for these changes.

The quality of the graphics is in some cases poor, but they have been included as they give an indication of location even when the keys are not clearly decipherable. The terms 'Environmental Assessment' and 'Environmental Impact Assessment' are interchangeable, reflecting the local usage.

The author details at the end of each case study were those supplied at the initial presentation of the materials to IAIA and may not be current addresses.

For enquiries, inputs and feedback on the use of this document please contact:

The Economics & Trade Branch
Division of Technology, Industry and Economics
United Nations Environment Programme
11-13 chemin des Anémones
CH - 1219 Châtelaine/Geneva , Switzerland
Phone: +41 (22) 917 8298
Fax: +41 (22) 917 8076
Email: etb@unep.ch

For manual updates and information on the Internet, access the Australian EIA Network at :
<http://www.environment.gov.au/net/eianet.html>

Designed and typeset by Mary McCabe Publications

Printed on recycled paper
ISBN 92 - 807- 2298 - 0

The United Nations Environment Programme

The United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) is the overall coordinating environmental organization of the United Nations system. Its mission is to provide leadership and encourage partnerships in caring for the environment by inspiring, informing and enabling nations and people to improve their quality of life without compromising that of future generations.

UNEP's Economics and Trade Branch (ETB) is one of the branches of the Division of Technology, Industry and Economics (DTIE). Its mission is to enhance capacities of countries, particularly developing countries and countries with economies in transition, and to integrate environmental considerations in development planning and macroeconomic policies, including trade policies. The work programme of the Branch consists of three main components: economics, trade and financial services. The Economics component of the programme focuses on enhancing the capacities of countries, particularly developing countries and countries with economies in transition, to develop and implement assessment tools and economic instruments.

UNEP's work on assessments includes the further development and promotion of environmental impact assessment as an effective tool to integrate environmental considerations at the project, programme and policy levels to achieve sustainable development.

For more information, please contact:
Hussein Abaza
Chief, Economics and Trade Branch
Division of Technology, Industry and Economics
United Nations Environment Programme
11-13 chemin des Anémones
CH-1219 Châtelaine/Geneva
Tel: +41 (22) 917 8298 or 917 8179
Fax: +41 (22) 917 8076
email: hussein.abaza@unep.ch
Internet: <http://www.unep.ch/etu>

Contents

| | |
|-------------------------------------|------|
| Preface | ix |
| Acknowledgements | xi |
| Getting value from the case studies | xiii |

Case studies

| | |
|---|-----|
| Environmental Impact Assessment from a Sudanese Perspective | 1 |
| Environmental assessment of the Safir-Hadramout Road project | 7 |
| Current status of the environmental impact assessment system in Ethiopia | 17 |
| State of the environment in Sudan | 27 |
| Institutionalization of environmental assessment in the public sector– a strategic approach | 37 |
| Devolution of environmental regulation: EIA in Malaysia | 45 |
| Environmental impact assessment in Nigeria: regulatory background and procedural framework | 63 |
| Public participation in Indonesian EIA | 75 |
| Public hearing within the environmental impact assessment review process | 85 |
| Environmental impact assessment of the Camisea Gas Project | 93 |
| Wetland conservation: institutional constraints and community awareness | 111 |
| Selecting development options through environment-based planning approaches | 117 |
| The Termosantander gas turbine project | 131 |
| Glycol waste incineration in a wet process | 143 |
| Experiences in the first pulp mill project submitted to the environmental impact assessment system in Chile | 147 |
| Environmental impact statement: 105 km highway corridor in the State of Durango | 159 |
| Monitoring the construction stage of the HP Toro hydroelectric project | 167 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Huites irrigation project | 173 |
| Environmental impact assessment: for whose needs? | 183 |
| Towards 'sustainable development' in the Southern African Development Community | 193 |
| Environmental auditing: the case of Ecuadorian industry | 203 |
| Social impact assessment: an interactive and participatory approach | 211 |
| New concepts for environmental impact assessment in Syria | 223 |
| Comprehensive planning for Naissaar Island, Estonia | 237 |
| Progress of environmental impact assessment and its methods in Colombia | 251 |
| Advancing the EIA system in the Philippines | 257 |
| EIA of the proposed midlands dam project: Mauritius | 261 |
| Environmental management of the Basmati River Basin | 269 |
| Assessed impacts of the proposed Bodhghat Hydroelectric project | 281 |
| EIA as applied in the case of 402 MW Arun-III Hydroelectric project | 295 |
| Glossary | 305 |

Preface

This publication is a companion volume to the *UNEP Environmental Impact Assessment Training Resource Manual*. It contains a series of case studies of EIA (and elements of SEA) practice in developing and transitional countries. As with the Manual itself, EIA centres and training institutions in developing countries are invited to take ownership of the case studies, and to further develop them for use in their region or country.

The case studies have been prepared by EIA specialists from developing countries to exemplify how the EIA process is implemented in different parts of the developing world and to identify difficulties that are commonly encountered in EIA practice in this context. No claim is made that these studies are representative of the status of EIA in particular countries or of best (or worst) practice. Their purpose is to provide supporting materials for EIA trainers who are designing and delivering courses based on the various topics covered in the Manual.

It is intended that the case studies will be of use in two main ways: First, they can be incorporated into customised training materials to give them added relevance and realism. Collectively, the compendium of studies can be reviewed to select examples and aspects of interest that correspond to one of the training topics contained in the Manual and approximate to the local situation.

Second, the studies can be used as 'reference points' or 'building blocks' to develop specific cases that reflect experience and issues of EIA practice in a country or region. In using the Manual, EIA trainers are encouraged to prepare locally appropriate materials, including case studies and examples.

Case studies as resource aids

The Manual is a generic tool kit for use by EIA trainers, particularly those in developing and transitional countries. The main objective is to facilitate the preparation of training courses and materials that are specific to a particular country or region. Resource aids are included to help EIA trainers to identify the needs of participants and to custom-design courses to meet them. There is guidance on the sources of EIA information that will be useful when preparing training courses and materials for each topic. EIA reports and supporting documents have been identified as particularly relevant as a resource for preparing locally appropriate case studies.

Case studies based on EIA Reports are one of the best means of relating EIA training to local conditions and realities. In particular, appropriate case studies offer lessons and insights on EIA strengths and weaknesses locally. They are valuable for a number of purposes, including:

- demonstrating the institutional arrangements and procedures for EIA implementation in a given country;
- illustrating how the main steps and activities of the EIA process are carried out locally;
- considering the environmental settings and types of impacts that are typically addressed in EIA practice; and
- highlighting key trends and issues of EIA practice, including areas where capacity needs to be improved.

However, copies of EIA reports are not always readily obtainable in many developing countries or they may be too descriptive to be easily translated into a case study. Indeed, relatively few case studies of EIA practice in developing countries are available in the literature of the field.

This compendium of cases has been compiled to help fill that gap.

Acknowledgements

This volume of case studies of environmental impact assessment (EIA) practice in developing countries was prepared in response to a UNEP's initiative to gather and make available country studies on EIA, in collaboration with the International Association for Impact Assessment (IAIA). This initiative is part of the Capacity Building Programme run by IAIA between 1997 and 1999, and funded by the Foreign Ministry of the Netherlands.

The Programme enabled over 90 EIA practitioners from developing countries and those moving to a market economy to participate in the Annual Meetings of IAIA during that period. Participants were selected for their professional experience, their demonstrated capacity to both learn and lead, and their ability to use their conference experiences to promote the ongoing development of impact assessment in their respective regions. Each was invited to bring to the meeting a case study demonstrating 'EIA practice' in their region.

A selection of these case studies has been included in this volume, which is a supplement to the second edition of the UNEP Environmental Impact Assessment Training Resource Manual. It is intended that Manual users will incorporate into their presentations and training Programmes this first-hand material and other local studies to give added relevance and credibility to the training materials. The cases included here have been chosen because they are appropriate to the various topics covered in the Manual; that other case studies presented by this group are not included does not mean that they are of less merit.

There is a separate compendium of case studies of strategic environmental assessment (SEA) in countries in transition. The Regional Environmental Centre (REC) for Central and Eastern Europe published this volume jointly with UNEP as part of the case studies project and work under the Sofia Initiative on EIA and SEA. The paper by Ly Jalakas, Estonian Ministry of the Environment is reproduced in this volume as well because of its possible applicability to developing countries.

Our thanks to IAIA for permission to use the materials and to the Director-General for International Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands for providing funding for the EIA Capacity Building Programme. Particular mention must be made of the work of Anneke Wevers, Environmental Assessment Advisor for the Department, who was the key link between the Ministry and IAIA, and the driving force behind the Capacity Building Programme.

Most importantly we wish to thank all participants in the Capacity Building Programme for the support they gave to each other and to the IAIA meetings in which they were involved and their generosity in sharing their expertise with the wider community of EIA practitioners.